

CONTENTS

PART I	INTRODUCTION <i>Barbara Bradby and Jo Murphy-Lawless</i>	
Chapter 1	Introduction: Childbirth Practices and Maternal Mortality	1
PART II	CHILDBIRTH PRACTICES IN BOLIVIA <i>Barbara Bradby</i>	
Chapter 2	The Field Studies	15
Chapter 3	The Traditional System of Birth Care	41
Chapter 4	Women's Experiences of Hospital Birth	93
Chapter 5	The Comparative Experience of Home and Hospital Birth	125
Chapter 6	The Relation Between the Two Systems of Birth Care	147
Chapter 7	Culturally Appropriate Strategies for Reducing Maternal Mortality ...	179
PART III	MATERNAL HEALTH AND MATERNAL MORTALITY: REDEFINING BIOMEDICAL FRAMES OF REFERENCE <i>Jo Murphy-Lawless</i>	
Chapter 8	The Construction of the Problem of Maternal Mortality in International Health Discourses	213
Chapter 9	Maternal Health and Maternal Mortality in Bolivia	219
Chapter 10	Preventing Maternal Mortality: the International Debate and Current Thinking	237
Chapter 11	Obstetric Arguments about Direct Causes of Maternal Death and the Risk of Encountering Them	253
Chapter 12	Traditional Birth Attendants and Empirical Midwives: Their Role in Responding to Maternal Mortality	277
Chapter 13	Bolivian Women's Experiences of Pregnancy, Birth and the Postpartum: Perspectives from the Quantitative Data	293
Chapter 14	Obstetric Policies and Practices: a Survey of Hospitals, Maternity Units and Rural Health Posts	361
PART IV	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS <i>Barbara Bradby and Jo Murphy-Lawless</i>	
Chapter 15	Conclusions and Recommendations	383
BIBLIOGRAPHY		393
APPENDICES		415

PART I

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION:

CHILDBIRTH PRACTICES AND MATERNAL MORTALITY

1.1	‘SOCIAL’ AND ‘BIOMEDICAL’ MODELS OF CHILDBIRTH	1
1.2	THE SOCIAL DIMENSIONS OF MATERNAL DEATH	3
1.3	CHILDBIRTH PRACTICES IN BOLIVIA	4
1.4	PLANNING FOR BIRTH CARE	6
1.4.1	The demographic context	6
1.4.2	The cultural context	7
1.5	SUMMARY OF BACKGROUND ASSUMPTIONS	8
1.6	STRUCTURE OF THE REPORT	9
1.6.1	Chapter outline	9

PART II

CHAPTER 2 THE FIELD STUDIES

2.1	AIMS AND OBJECTIVES	15
2.1.1	Birth and death	16
2.1.1.1	The CIES team’s encounter with death	16
2.1.1.2	The team decision to focus primarily on birth	17
2.1.1.3	The rejection of the ‘formal-informal’ dichotomy	18
2.1.2	Birth practices and women’s experiences	19
2.2	METHODOLOGY	20
2.2.1	The two phases of the main fieldwork	20
2.2.1.1	The qualitative phase	21
2.2.1.2	The quantitative phase	23
2.2.2	Other project work	24
2.2.2.1	ILCA’s preliminary work on Qaqachaka	24
2.2.2.2	Coordination work	25
2.2.2.3	The Agreement with the National Health Secretariat	26
2.2.2.4	The Meeting of Traditional Midwives organised by CIES	26
2.2.2.5	Dissemination in conjunction with the National Health Secretariat	27
2.3	THE FIELD SITES AND TEAMS	28
2.3.1	The La Paz area	28
2.3.1.1	The teams based in the La Paz area	28
2.3.1.2	The sites around the La Paz area	30

2.3.2	The Sucre area	31
2.3.2.1	The teams based in the Sucre area	31
2.3.2.2	The sites around the Sucre area	32
2.4	INTERNAL PROJECT REPORTS	34
2.4.1	Reports produced by CIES	34
2.4.1.1	Qualitative phase	34
2.4.1.2	Quantitative phase	34
2.4.1.3	Summary final report	34
2.4.1.4	Midwives' workshop	35
2.4.2	Reports produced by ILCA	35
2.4.2.1	Preliminary phase	35
2.4.2.2	Qualitative phase	35
2.4.2.3	Quantitative phase	35
2.4.2.4	Summary final report	36
2.4.3	Reports produced by TCD	36
2.4.3.1	Qualitative phase	36
2.4.3.2	Quantitative phase	36
2.4.3.3	Obstetric practices	37
2.4.4	Reports produced by TIFAP	37
2.4.4.1	Qualitative phase	37
2.4.4.2	Quantitative phase	37
2.4.4.3	Vocabularies	37
2.4.4.4	Final summary reports	37
2.4.5	Reports produced by the University of St. Andrew's	38
2.4.5.1	Qualitative phase	38
2.4.5.2	Quantitative phase	38
2.4.6	Transcriptions of interviews	38
2.5	PUBLIC DISSEMINATION AND DOCUMENTATION	39
2.6	SUMMARY DESCRIPTION OF THE FIELD STUDIES	39

CHAPTER 3 THE TRADITIONAL SYSTEM OF BIRTH CARE

3.1	THE SYSTEM AS DESCRIBED BY ILCA	41
3.1.1	Birth within the Andean cosmovision	41
3.1.2	The ethnophysiology of pregnancy and birth	42
3.1.2.1	Fertility and conception	42
3.1.2.2	Pregnancy and the development of the foetus	42
3.1.2.3	The two births: the baby and the placenta	43
3.1.2.4	Beliefs about the placenta and the uterus	44

3.1.2.5	The ethnophysiology of retained placenta and haemorrhage	45
3.1.2.6	The post-partum period and <i>sobreparto</i>	46
3.1.2.7	Ethno-classifications of types of womb and body	47
3.1.2.8	Theories of causes of problems in pregnancy and birth	48
3.1.3	Care during pregnancy	48
3.1.3.1	Specialist care	48
3.1.3.2	Family care and ‘looking after oneself’	50
3.1.4	Care during the birth of the baby	50
3.1.4.1	Principles of care	50
3.1.4.2	Family care	51
3.1.4.3	Specialist care	51
3.1.4.4	Difficult births	52
3.1.5	Care during the birth of the placenta	53
3.1.5.1	The two methods of cord-cutting and placental management	54
3.1.5.2	The quantitative study of systems of placental management	56
3.1.5.3	Practices to release the placenta and prevent it rising	59
3.1.5.4	The burial of the placenta	59
3.1.6	Care during the post-partum period	60
3.1.6.1	Nutrition	60
3.1.6.2	Warmth	60
3.1.6.3	Rest	61
3.1.6.4	Practices in relation to blood flow and haemorrhage	61
3.1.6.5	Practices in relation to <i>sobreparto</i> and other post-partum problems	62
3.2	CARE IN HOME BIRTHS IN PERI-URBAN AREAS OF LA PAZ (CIES)	63
3.2.1	Choice in the place of birth	63
3.2.2	The combination of traditional and modern practices	63
3.2.3	Practices in relation to cord-cutting and the placenta	64
3.2.4	The traditional system in the urban context	65
3.3	CARE IN HOME BIRTHS IN A QUECHUA-SPEAKING RURAL AREA (TIFAP)	66
3.3.1	Ethnophysiology and theory of the female body	66
3.3.2	Prohibitions during pregnancy	67
3.3.3	The gaze during birth	69
3.3.4	Mediation of the products of the woman’s body by others	70
3.3.5	Care during the post-partum period	70
3.3.6	Expertise in techniques of massage	71
3.4	DEATH FROM SAJT’AY (UNIVERSITY OF ST. ANDREW’S/TIFAP)	72
3.5	CARE IN HOME BIRTHS IN PERI-URBAN AREAS OF SUCRE (TCD& TIFAP)	73
3.5.1	Starting from women’s experience/s	73
3.5.2	Doña Emilia’s life story: norms and realities of family care	74

3.5.3	Shame and confidence	79
3.5.4	The focus on delivery of the placenta and after	80
3.5.5	The urban midwife's system of care	80
3.5.6	Use of institutional ante-natal care by women giving birth at home ...	82
3.5.7	Women's experiences in attending the births of others	83
3.6	CARE DURING THE BIRTH OF THE PLACENTA IN THE QUECHUA-SPEAKING AREAS (RURAL AND PERI-URBAN)	84
3.7.	CONCLUSIONS: TRADITIONAL BIRTH CARE AS A SYSTEM	85
3.7.1	Systematic care	85
3.7.2	Comparison with the 'physiological model'	87
3.7.3	The influence of institutional medical practices in the 'traditional' sphere	89
3.8	SUMMARY DESCRIPTION OF THE TRADITIONAL SYSTEM OF BIRTH CARE	90

CHAPTER 4 EXPERIENCES OF HOSPITAL BIRTH

4.1	QUALITATIVE ACCOUNTS OF HOSPITAL BIRTH FROM PERI-URBAN SUCRE	93
4.1.1	Unattended births in hospital	94
4.1.2	Expectations of 'care' and of 'help'	97
4.1.3	The practice of pressing on the abdomen	98
4.1.4	Tears and episiotomies	100
4.1.5	The birth of the placenta and the 'cleansing'	101
4.1.6	The 'gynaecological position'	104
4.1.7	From the fear of hospital to the voicing of complaints	105
4.1.8	Negotiating birth	108
4.2	THE QUESTIONNAIRE STUDY OF WOMEN'S HOSPITAL EXPERIENCES	111
4.2.1	Experiences of intervention	112
4.2.1.1	Caesarean rates and socio-economic status	114
4.2.2	Medical pluralism in relation to hospital birth	117
4.3	LANGUAGE, CULTURE AND ETHNICITY	118
4.3.1	The experience of monolingual native-language speakers in hospital ..	119
4.3.2	The resource of bilingualism among migrant women	120
4.4	SUMMARY OF WOMEN'S EXPERIENCES OF HOSPITAL BIRTH	122

CHAPTER 5 THE COMPARATIVE EXPERIENCE OF HOME AND HOSPITAL BIRTH

5.1	TRADITIONAL MIDWIVES' VIEW OF HOSPITAL BIRTH	125
5.1.1	Operations versus massage	126
5.1.2	Feeling the pulse versus manual penetration	128
5.1.3	The culturo-religious critique of hospital birth	129

5.2	COMPARISONS FROM THE QUESTIONNAIRE STUDY	131
5.2.1	Birth position	133
5.2.2	Feeling cold	133
5.2.3	Fear	134
5.2.4	Manual pressure on the abdomen	136
5.2.5	The use of traditional practices	137
5.2.6	Summary of questionnaire findings on the home-hospital birth comparison	137
5.3	WOMEN'S PREFERENCES FOR HOME OR HOSPITAL BIRTH	139
5.4	REFLECTIONS FROM TWO MOTHERS' CLUBS	140
5.4.1	Treatment and maltreatment	140
5.4.2	Preparation for episiotomy	141
5.4.3	Medical students and being on display	141
5.4.4	Abdominal pressure and 'the cleansing'	142
5.4.5	Traditional practices	142
5.4.6	Home births	143
5.5	SUMMARY OF FINDINGS ON THE COMPARATIVE EXPERIENCE	144

CHAPTER 6 RELATIONS BETWEEN THE TWO SYSTEMS OF BIRTH CARE

6.1	THE NATIONAL CONTEXT: THE 'VIEW FROM ABOVE'	147
6.1.1	The structure of the professions involved in birth care	147
6.1.1.1	The biomedical professions: international comparisons	147
6.1.1.2	Regional distribution of biomedical personnel	148
6.1.1.3	Midwifery as a biomedical profession	151
6.1.1.4	Implications for hospital birth attention	152
6.1.1.5	The social distribution of birth attention by traditional midwives	152
6.1.2	National planning for traditional birth care	155
6.1.2.1	The view of traditional birth care in <i>Plan Vida</i>	155
6.1.2.2	The cultural adaptation of hospital birth: 'humanised birth'	157
6.1.2.3	State training of traditional midwives	158
6.2	FINDINGS AT LOCAL LEVEL: THE 'VIEW FROM BELOW'	161
6.2.1	The availability of birth care	161
6.2.1.1	Traditional specialist care	161
6.2.1.2	Biomedical care	163
6.2.1.3	'Humanised birth'	165
6.2.2	The traditional apprenticeship system	165
6.2.3	Trained midwives versus traditional midwives - the Encounter	166
6.2.4	Midwives' relation to the institutional medical system	167

6.2.4.1	The trained midwife in a rural area of northern Potosí	168
6.2.4.2	Midwives in the rural town of Ocurf	169
6.2.4.3	The migrant midwife in peri-urban Sucre	172
6.2.5	Midwives' relation to family care	175
6.3	CONCLUSIONS ON THE RELATION BETWEEN THE TWO SYSTEMS	176

**CHAPTER 7 CULTURALLY APPROPRIATE STRATEGIES FOR REDUCING
MATERNAL MORTALITY**

7.1	THE CONTEXT: TRADITIONAL THINKING ON MATERNAL DEATH	180
7.2	POSITIVE ASPECTS OF TRADITIONAL BIRTH CARE	185
7.2.1	Birth position	185
7.2.2	Warmth	186
7.2.3	The social and religious context of care	187
7.2.4	Massage	188
7.2.5	The traditional system of placental delivery	188
7.3	OTHER ASPECTS OF TRADITIONAL BIRTH CARE THAT WARRANT FURTHER RESEARCH	189
7.4	STRATEGIES FOR IMPROVING WOMEN'S EXPERIENCES OF HOSPITAL BIRTH: THE PROCESS OF DIALOGUE	190
7.4.1	The women's workshop in El Alto	190
7.4.2	Project dissemination in conjunction with the National Health Secretariat	193
7.4.3	Dissemination in El Alto in conjunction with the Health Secretariat ..	194
7.4.4	Conceptual dialogue and personal networks	195
7.5	THE ARTICULATION OF CULTURAL SYSTEMS OF BIRTH CARE	195
7.5.1	From 'humanised birth' to cultural choice	198
7.5.2	Articulation of care in home births	199
7.5.2.1	The supply of midwives in rural areas	199
7.5.2.2	Recognition of midwives in urban areas	200
7.5.2.3	Discouraging imitation of obstetric practices in home births	201
7.5.2.4	The diffusion of life-saving technologies	202
7.5.3	Articulation of care in hospital births	202
7.5.3.1	Translation and advocacy	202
7.5.3.2	Systemic articulation in routine hospital care	203
7.5.4	The problem of emergency care	205
7.6	SUMMARY: CULTURALLY APPROPRIATE STRATEGIES	207

PART III**CHAPTER 8 THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE PROBLEM OF MATERNAL MORTALITY
IN INTERNATIONAL HEALTH DISCOURSES**

8.1	THE WHO PROTOCOLS	213
8.2	THE SAFE MOTHERHOOD INITIATIVE	215
8.3	CONCLUSIONS	218

CHAPTER 9 MATERNAL HEALTH AND MATERNAL MORALITY IN BOLIVIA

9.1	CURRENT DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE	219
9.2	THE EFFECTS OF POVERTY AND MARGINALISATION ON MATERNAL HEALTH	221
9.3	COVERAGE OF WOMEN BY THE STATE HEALTH SERVICES	223
9.4	MATERNAL MORTALITY STATISTICS	225
9.5	GOVERNMENT STRATEGIES ABOUT MATERNAL HEALTH	229
9.6	CONCLUSION	235

**CHAPTER 10 PREVENTING MATERNAL MORTALITY:
THE INTERNATIONAL DEBATE AND CURRENT THINKING**

10.1	MODES OF PREVENTION	237
10.2	THE REDUCTION OF MATERNAL MORTALITY: MEDICAL OR SOCIAL FACTORS?	237
10.3	HIGH RISK/LOW RISK MODELS OF PREDICTING MATERNAL MORTALITY	243
10.4	ESSENTIAL OBSTETRIC SERVICES	247
10.5	CONCLUSION	250

**CHAPTER 11 OBSTETRIC ARGUMENTS ABOUT THE DIRECT CAUSES OF
MATERNAL DEATH AND THE RISK OF ENCOUNTERING THEM**

11.1	CAUSES OF DEATH AND DIFFERENCES OF MEDICAL OPINION ABOUT THEM	253
11.2	OBSTETRIC HAEMORRHAGE	254
11.2.1	Antepartum haemorrhage	254
11.2.2	Postpartum haemorrhage	255
11.3	OBSTRUCTED LABOUR	266
11.4	PUERPERAL SEPSIS AND SEPTICAEMIA	270
11.5	HYPERTENSION, PRE-ECLAMPSIA AND ECLAMPSIA	271
11.6	CONCLUSION	274

**CHAPTER 12 TRADITIONAL BIRTH ATTENDANTS AND EMPIRICAL MIDWIVES:
THEIR ROLE IN RESPONDING TO MATERNAL MORTALITY**

12.1	OBSTETRICS, INTERNATIONAL HEALTH PROGRAMMES, AND TRADITIONAL OR EMPIRICAL MIDWIFERY	277
12.2	TRAINING TBAs: THE BOLIVIAN PROGRAMME	280
12.3	AMBIGUITIES IN THE TREATMENT OF TBAs	282
12.4	EFFECTIVENESS OF TBA PROGRAMMES	283
12.5	MODELS OF GOOD PRACTICE: THE FORTALEZA EXPERIENCE	286
12.6	CONCLUSION	291

**CHAPTER 13 BOLIVIAN WOMEN'S EXPERIENCES OF PREGNANCY, BIRTH
AND THE POSTPARTUM: PERSPECTIVES FROM THE QUANTITATIVE DATA**

13.1	THE DESIGN AND ADMINISTRATION OF THE QUESTIONNAIRE: DEALING WITH DIFFERENCE	293
13.2	FIELDWORK SITES, SAMPLE SIZE AND PLACE OF BIRTH	296
13.3	SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS AND OTHER SPECIAL CONCERNS FROM EACH SITE	300
13.3.1	Age and parity	300
13.3.2	Maternal mortality	302
13.3.3	Language and language usage	305
13.3.4	Losses in traditional customs and the impact on women	307
13.4	COMPOSITE FINDINGS ON PREGNANCY, BIRTH AND THE POSTPARTUM PERIOD ..	309
13.4.1	The amalgamated data set	309
13.4.2	Pregnancy	310
13.4.2.1	Physical and other problems during pregnancy	310
13.4.2.2	Seeking advice and help during pregnancy	315
13.4.2.3	Use of traditional Andean practices to assist women during pregnancy ...	316
13.4.2.4	Summary of findings about pregnancy: problems and care	318
13.4.3	Birth: process and outcomes	319
13.4.3.1	Who helps women at home and in hospital?	319
13.4.3.2	Length of time in labour	321
13.4.3.3	Birth positions	323
13.4.3.4	Traditional help during labour	325
13.4.3.5	Problems during labour	328
13.4.3.6	Biomedical interventions in labour	331
13.4.3.7	Delivery of the placenta and postpartum problems	336
13.4.3.8	Customs around birth: asking for the placenta, special food after the birth, and rest and washing after the birth	346
13.4.3.9	Desired place of birth	349
13.5	CONCLUSION	352

**CHAPTER 14 OBSTETRIC POLICIES AND PRACTICES: A SURVEY OF
HOSPITALS, MATERNITY UNITS, AND RURAL HEALTH POSTS**

14.1	DEVELOPING APPROPRIATE OBSTETRIC CARE	361
14.2	SURVEYING MATERNITY UNITS	363
14.3	ROUTINE PRACTICES OF SHAVING, ENEMA AND VAGINAL EXAMINATIONS	364
14.4	WALKING DURING LABOUR	366
14.5	INDUCTION OF LABOUR	366
14.6	ACCELERATION OF LABOUR	368
14.7	CAESAREAN SECTIONS	371
14.8	BIRTH POSITION	374
14.9	EPISIOTOMY	375
14.10	FORCEPS	376
14.11	THIRD STAGE MANAGEMENT AND HAEMORRHAGE	377
14.12	CONCLUSION	378

PART IV

CHAPTER 15 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

15.1	MODELS AND PRACTICES OF BIRTH CARE	383
15.2	RECOMMENDATIONS	385
15.2.1	Dialogue-building measures	386
15.2.2	Measures to allay cultural fears of hospital birth and to improve the quality of care	387
15.2.3	Measures to arrest the decline of midwives in rural areas	388
15.2.4	Measures to improve health system provision of emergency care	389
15.2.5	Further research	390
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	393
	APPENDICES	415

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

CHAPTER 2

Map 1	Field sites	29
-------	-------------------	----

CHAPTER 3

Table 3.1	Time taken for the placenta to be born, by whether the umbilical cord is cut before or after the birth of the placenta	57
Table 3.2	Time taken for the placenta to be born, by the position of the mother during the birth of the baby, and the birth of the placenta	58

CHAPTER 4

Table 4.1	Proportions of women experiencing different kinds of hospital intervention, by study site	112
Table 4.2	Caesarean rates by socio-economic group of patient, Sucre Maternity Hospital, 1994	114
Table 4.3	Measures of Caesarean rates from the Sucre peri-urban study data, according to different denominators of population and by socio-economic indicators	115
Table 4.4	Proportions of women with hospital births using traditional practices during pregnancy and labour (three sites)	118

CHAPTER 5

Table 5.1	Comparative data on experiences and practices in home and hospital births: two peri-urban and two rural studies	138
-----------	---	-----

CHAPTER 6

Table 6.1	Departments ranked by density of public sector doctors and nurses/auxiliary nurses (index of urbanisation shown in brackets)	150
Table 6.2	Percentages of births attended by traditional midwives, by selected characteristics (from national data for 1994)	153

CHAPTER 13

Figure 1	Place of Last Birth	298
Figure 2	Urban/Rural Place of Birth	299
Figure 3	Respondents by Age Group	300
Figure 4	Respondents Grouped by Parity	301
Figure 5	Languages Spoken	306
Figure 6	Overall Distribution of Languages	307

Figure 7	Problems During Pregnancy	311
Figure 8	Seeking Help During Pregnancy	315
Figure 9	Traditional Help During Pregnancy	316
Figure 10	Composite Data on Birth Attendants During Last Birth	319
Figure 11	Length of Time in Labour	320
Figure 12	Birth Position	324
Figure 13	Traditional Help During Labour	326
Figure 14	Reported Problems During Labour	329
Figure 15	Types of Biomedical Interventions Reported	332
Figure 16	Positions for Placental Delivery	337
Figure 17	Time at which the Cord is Cut	338
Figure 18	Placental Delivery and Putting Baby to the Breast	340
Figure 19	Time Waiting for the Placenta	341
Figure 20	Assisting Placental Delivery	342
Figure 21	Postpartum Problems	345
Figure 22	Special Diet after Birth	347
Figure 23	Desired Place of Birth	349

ABBREVIATIONS

AYUFAM	<i>Ayuda a la Familia</i>
CIES	<i>Centro de Investigación, Educación y Servicios</i>
CSRA	<i>Consejo de Salud Rural Andino</i>
CVMMP	<i>Comité de Vigilancia de la Muerte Materna y Perinatal</i>
EC	European Community
ENDSA	<i>Encuesta Nacional de Demografía y Salud</i>
ILCA	<i>Instituto de Lengua y Cultura Aymara</i>
INE	<i>Instituto Nacional de Estadística</i>
IPTK	<i>Instituto Politécnico Tupak Katari</i>
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
PHO	Pan-American Health Organisation
SNIS	<i>Secretaría Nacional de Información de Salud</i>
SNS	<i>Secretaría Nacional de Salud</i>
SOBOMETRA	<i>Sociedad Boliviana de Medicina Tradicional</i>
TAHIPAMU	<i>Taller de Historia y Participación de la Mujer</i>
TBA	Traditional birth attendants
TCD	Trinity College Dublin
TIFAP	<i>Talleres de Investigación y Formación Académica y Popular</i>
UNDP	United Nations Development Plan
WHO	World Health Organisation